

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46

Brookline Preservation Commission
MINUTES OF THE February 9, 2021 MEETING
Held Virtually using Zoom Online Software

Commissioners Present:

Elton Elperin, Chair
Richard Panciera, Vice Chair
David King
Wendy Ecker
Peter Kleiner
David Jack
Elizabeth Armstrong, Alternate
John Spiers, Alternate
Jim Batchelor

Commissioners Absent:

Staff: Valerie Birmingham, Tina McCarthy

Mr. Elperin called the meeting to order at 6:30 PM.

Approval of Minutes

Minutes 10/27/2020

Mr. Elperin – no comments. Motion to approve minutes. Ms. Ecker seconded. All voted in favor.

Minutes 12/8/2020

Mr. Elperin – Line 80 – add “might be allowed as an exception”
Line 89 – intersect the existing gambrel? Change.

Minutes approved with changes. Mr. King second. All in favor.

PUBLIC HEARINGS – LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICTS

173-175 Walnut Street (Pill Hill LHD) –Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install fencing at the side and front property lines and make changes to the grade in the front yard. (Storey Condominium, applicants). **Precinct 5**

Jeremy Wong – owner, no comments,

No Public Comments

Mr. Jack – height of existing fences?

Jeremy Wong – 6’ & 42”

47
48 Ms. Ecker – photo of step down?
49
50 Jeremy Wong – take advice on that
51
52 Mr. Elperin – improvement in landscaping.
53 One path & one gate.
54
55 Jeremy Wong – no, other examples on street
56
57 Mr. Elperin – 6’ to front of house is fine. Lower in front yard - should be.
58
59 Mr. King – agree.
60
61 Jeremy Wong – can lower to 42”
62
63 Mr. Elperin – will be near other front fence at 42”.
64 Photograph is more open than drawing. Better in photo, copy that spacing.
65
66 Jeremy Wong – can do.
67
68 Mr. Batchelor – good proposal, nice to have front fence at side back to house. Should be more
69 open.
70
71 Jeremy Wong – oppose, don’t like look, but if you want it ok. Tapered?
72
73 Mr. Batchelor – thanks.
74
75 Mr. Elperin – with Mr. Batchelor but less strong.
76
77 Mr. King – makes sense for 2 fences same height, same design. No taper
78
79 Mr. Batchelor – have to check. Can they do without steps.
80
81 Mr. Elperin – curb. Why?
82
83 Mr. Batchelor – like look. Don’t like front yard slope. Looks absurd want level front yard.
84
85 Mr. Elperin – historic practice is common front yard. Something is lost.
86
87 Mr. Panciera – step up curb to get to walk?
88
89 Jeremy Wong – step and gate set back from curb. 3’ x 3’ low area, then step
90
91 Mr. Panciera – precedent for curb and fence. 87 Walnut; 163 Walnut with black or metal fence.
92 But understand what you are saying. Step into yard is nice but not accessible.

93
94 Mr. Batchelor moved to accept with modification to use picket along left to front corner of house.
95 Spacing and size to match photo.
96
97 Mr. Elperin seconded. All voted in favor.
98
99
100 **131 Carlton Street (Cottage Farm LHD)** – Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to
101 construct a single car garage, remove basement window and well, remove and install fencing, patio
102 and pavers, demolition and construction of side porch and stairs, replace side door, construct new
103 wall (Evan and Amy Lieberman, applicants). **Precinct 1**
104
105 Ms. Birmingham presented the case.
106
107 Jennifer Dopazo Gilbert introduced the applicants. Architect will share clarifications.
108
109 Sheldon Baker presented a slideshow.
110
111 Public Comment
112
113 Ken Goldstein – represent abutters at 33 Euston. Want to support but mitigate impact. Garage
114 is on property line. No room for fence between garage and property line. Will accept a wood
115 fence between their property and garage. Gap between house and garage means no room for
116 fence. Restriction on height also impacts abutters. Relax requirements for abutter’s sake.
117 Concerned about trees.
118
119 Ms. Birmingham – space between garage and house does not exist in this proposal
120
121 Jennifer Dopazo Gilbert – yes, we can address some of these concerns
122
123 Mr. Batchelor – talk about areas as whole.
124
125 Jennifer Dopazo Gilbert – we are prepared to make changes.
126
127 Mr. Elperin – a 1.2 floor plan, garage. Fence will be glued to garage.
128
129 Sheldon Baker – metal siding not required on neighbors side. 2’ gap garage to house, narrow
130 garage to 11’6” makes room to put fence. Eliminate parapet.
131
132 Mr. Elperin – low wall in rear?
133
134 Sheldon Baker – Salvage stone from patio.
135
136 Mr. Elperin – match foundation?
137
138 Sheldon Baker – yes.

139
140 Mr. Elperin – rubber roof visible?
141
142 Sheldon Baker – yes.
143
144 Mr. King – side of garage vertical?
145
146 Sheldon Baker – not metal, cedar. Vertical to match fence.
147
148 Mr. King – door metal roll up?
149
150 Sheldon Baker – yes, due to sloped roof.
151
152 Mr. Elperin – if detached, flat?
153
154 Sheldon Baker – current minimizes visibility.
155
156 Mr. King – right place for garage. Sloped roof is ok. Low garage.
157
158 Mr. Elperin – clever solution. Like landscape element.
159
160 Mr. Panciera – Not prominent feature, ok.
161
162 Mr. Batchelor – ok.
163
164 Ms. Armstrong – appreciate detached garage. Good solution.
165
166 Mr. Elperin – Ms. Armstrong vote for Peter. Ms. Armstrong – yes.
167
168 Mr. Elperin – Motion to move garage to subcommittee, approve general idea. Empowered
169 subcommittee
170 Mr. King – second. Don’t like horizontal railing.
171
172 Mr. Elperin – I have questions about stone wall.
173 Mr. King seconded the motion.
174
175 Peter Kleiner left meeting.
176
177 Mr. King – yes. Mr. Jack – yes, Ms. Ecker – yes, Mr. Elperin – yes, Mr. Batchelor – yes, Ms.
178 Armstrong – yes, Mr. Panciera – yes, Mr. Spiers – yes.
179
180 Mr. Panciera on subcommittee with Mr. King & Mr. Elperin.
181
182
183 **PUBLIC HEARINGS – DEMOLITION**
184

185 **1684 Beacon Street** – Request to lift the stay of partial demolition on the building (Beacon 19
186 Properties LLC, applicants). **Precinct 13**

187
188 Ms. Birmingham presented the case.

189
190 Owen Thomas – architect, reviewed the design.

191
192 Public Comment

193
194 Virginia Smith – like proposal

195 Ken Rosen - at 1680. How long will project take?

196 Jennifer Dopazo Gilbert – we will address at Planning Board meeting.

197
198 Mr. Jack – rear is public?

199
200 Ms. Birmingham – no and not in LHD.

201
202 Mr. Jack – windows original

203
204 Owen Thomas – many are.

205
206 Mr. Elperin – penalization of fiber board cement. Makes tiny pieces.

207
208 Mr. King – I like the overhang. Otherwise it is too flat.

209
210 Mr. Panciera – go wild on that cornice. Beacon Street Cornice. Boston Sash new windows. At
211 dormer in 1980 meeting rails aligned. Please align up your rails.

212
213 Mr. Jack – good catch. Otherwise great. Keep cornice at rear.

214
215 Owen Thomas – roof will repair in kind.

216
217 Mr. Elperin – meeting rails align, align seams to window openings.

218 Motion to accept with these changes. Mr. King seconded.

219
220 Mr. King – yes. Mr. Jack – yes, Ms. Ecker – yes, Mr. Elperin – yes, Mr. Batchelor – yes, Ms.
221 Armstrong – yes, Mr. Panciera – yes, Mr. Spiers – yes.

222
223

224 **16 Harrison Street** – Application for the full demolition of the detached garage (Kelsey and Andrew
225 Miller, applicants). **Precinct 3**

226
227 Ms. Birmingham presented the case.

228
229 Jennifer Dopazo Gilbert – introduced architect Monika Pauli.

230

231 Monika Pauli – agree with history but too much change and poor condition.
232
233 No Public Comment
234
235 Ms. Ecker – significant
236
237 Mr. Panciera- agree with Ms. Ecker. Others have been significant.
238
239 Mr. King – we can find significant and then lift stay and allow demo.
240
241 Mr. Elperin – increasingly hard to preserve these. We have LHDs for that level of protection.
242
243 Mr. Batchelor – have there been other Brook Skinner garages saved?
244
245 Mr. Spiers – asks about what parameters are – could all be gradually demo by neglect?
246
247 Mr. Batchelor – should find significant because it is standing vertical. Do wish for inventory of
248 preserved garages.
249
250 Commission discusses past cases.
251
252 Mr. Elperin – should not save outside LHDs.
253
254 Mr. King – agree.
255
256 Mr. King – Motion to uphold significance. Ms. Ecker seconded.
257
258 Mr. King – yes. Mr. Jack – yes, Ms. Ecker – yes, Mr. Elperin – yes, Mr. Batchelor – yes, Ms.
259 Armstrong – yes, Mr. Panciera – yes, Mr. Spiers – yes.
260
261
262 **93 Seaver Street** – Application for the full demolition of the house (93 Viewpoint LLC, applicant).
263 **Precinct 14**
264
265 Jacob Walters – lawyer. Purchased in July.
266
267 Lucio Trabucco – architect. Vacant. Needs to be gutted. No insulation. Iron fence is rotted.
268
269 Public Comment
270
271 Myron Spector – abutters, share driveway 30 years residents. This house was occupied through
272 the spring. Important home 100 years of protections in neighborhood. House can be upgraded.
273
274 Carlos Ridruejo – TMM, architect and resident of neighborhood. Present owners removed heat.
275 Approach is demo by neglect. Extensive renovations should be expected. No reason to demo.
276

277 Vinca Jarrett – attorney. Criminal to tear down. Lawyer and builder have misrepresented. This
278 is what Brookline stands for.
279
280 Gary King – abutters – endorse all comments. Former owners were elderly, repairs understood.
281 Where did attorney get idea of unoccupied?
282
283 Jacob Walter – have not been inside house, told it was unoccupied. Saw photos of interior.
284 Impression given condition. Apologies.
285
286 Mr. Elperin – true oil tank removed?
287
288 Jacob Walters – maybe.
289
290 Lucio Trabucco – was heated by oil.
291
292 Virginia Smith – TMM Pct 4. Care about historic arch. This is a gem. This is demo by neglect.
293 Can be restored.
294
295 Mairo Pinto – owner of house. Inside asbestos everywhere.
296
297 Joseph Smith – 83 Seaver Street neighbor. Not abandoned. Beautiful .
298
299 Arthur Segel – Brooklyn resident. Spent many holidays at this home beautiful views and nice
300 layout.
301
302 Sam Lux – former owner. Wife died last year. Did not use upstairs. Systems are old but outside
303 is well maintained. No asbestos except in basement. House is in reasonable shape.
304
305 Pam Lodish – 120 Seaver. Offended by applicant’s presentation. How can oil tank be removed?
306
307 Mini Kolluri – 67 Buckminster. Everyone here appreciates their homes.
308
309 Joshua Sparrow – in favor of affordable housing? Joy to pass by these beautiful homes.
310 Financial motive deprives us of sense of place.
311
312 Mr. Panciera– significant.
313
314 Mr. Jack – beautiful and in an NR district.
315
316 Mr. King – what can we do about the heat?
317
318 Mr. Batchelor – we don’t know all of circumstance. Let’s figure this out.
319
320 Ms. McCarthy – will take up with Building Dept.
321
322 Mr. Jack – talks about letter and intent to demolish.

323
324 Mr. Batchelor – Motion to find significant. Mr. Elperin seconded.
325
326 Mr. King – yes. Mr. Jack – yes, Ms. Ecker – yes, Mr. Elperin – yes, Mr. Batchelor – yes, Ms.
327 Armstrong – yes, Mr. Panciera – yes, Mr. Spiers – yes.
328
329
330 **116 Thorndike Street** – Application for the full demolition of the house (116 Thorndike Street,
331 LLC, applicant). **Precinct 9**
332
333 Daniel Gersh – purchased, understand delay. Street is appealing. Want to capture architecture
334 of past.
335
336 Public Comment
337
338 Vinca Jarrett – 160 Thorndike, knew former owners. Lots of restoration by former owners.
339 Beautiful home, makes neighborhood.
340
341 Susan Regan – abutter. Agree. This style defines neighborhood.
342
343 Nicole Reindorf – Thorndike, 5 houses down. This is why I moved here. Interiors could never
344 be replicated.
345
346 Mark Rosen – agree. Beautiful. Why people come to Brookline. Live in McKay Home.
347
348 Lee Rosenbaum & Marilyn, 73 Coolidge Street. Love neighborhood.
349
350 Iya Kessler- 120 Thorndike – for 5 years. Love architecture here. Want to talk with developer.
351
352 Tania Schlatter – 121 Thorndike. Unique design. Nothing like it.
353
354 Joshua Sparrow – 93 Thorndike. Only center tower. Critical to preserve North Brookline.
355 Accessible for all to enjoy.
356
357 Hildy Grossman – Next door, white house 30 years. Most beautiful house on street. What do
358 we care about? Been inside house marvelous paneling. Fine shape.
359
360 Edward Bumas – live on Thorndike 23 years – love home. Irreplaceable. 40+ neighbors
361 engaging in the last few days. United and supported.
362
363 Virginia Smith – do not see as beautiful but has character hilarious and magical.
364
365 Sloat Shaw – Thorndike, support significance.
366
367 Andrew Liebman – live in neighborhood.
368

369 Miguel Liebman – live on Thorndike, close by. We wanted to buy 116, beautiful.
370
371 Mr. Jack – significant.
372
373 Mr. Elperin – appreciate Virginia Smith’s comment, dramatic house.
374
375 Mr. Panciera – commented on unusual design.
376
377 Mr. Batchelor – significant. Live pretty close to house. LHD discussions? Teardowns
378 eventually change the character. Motion to uphold significance.
379
380 Mr. Elperin seconded.
381
382 Mr. King – yes. Mr. Jack – yes, Ms. Ecker – yes, Mr. Elperin – yes, Mr. Batchelor – yes, Ms.
383 Armstrong – yes, Mr. Panciera – yes, Mr. Spiers – yes.
384
385
386 The meeting adjourned 9:57 PM.