



# *Town of Brookline*

## *Massachusetts*

### **PLANNING BOARD**

Town Hall, 3<sup>rd</sup> Floor  
333 Washington Street  
Brookline, MA 02445-6899  
(617) 730-2130 Fax (617) 730-2442

Steve Heikin, Chair  
Robert Cook, Clerk  
James Carr  
Linda K. Hamlin  
Blair Hines  
Mathew Oudens  
Mark J. Zarrillo

To: Brookline Zoning Board of Appeals  
From: Brookline Planning Board  
Date: August 27, 2019  
Subject: Construct rear-side addition and replace existing detached garage.  
Location: 18 Spooner Road

Atlas Sheet:	66	Case #:	2019-0043
Block:	281	Zoning:	S-10
Lot:	31	Lot Area:	17,497 SF

Board of Appeals Hearing: September 5, 2019 at 7:00 pm

---

### **DEMOLITION/PRESERVATION**

The property is located in the Chestnut Hill North Local Historic District. In May, the Preservation Commission approved the proposed addition to the main dwelling as well as the demolition of the existing garage and construction of a new detached garage.

### **SITE AND NEIGHBORHOOD**

18 Spooner Road was constructed as a colonial revival single family dwelling in 1912. According to Preservation Planners, the building is an excellent example of its period and architectural style, retaining much of its original architectural detailing and character. The property is located in a neighborhood north of Route 9 near Single Tree Hill and the Chestnut Hill Reservoir. The neighborhood consists almost entirely of single-family dwellings. A variety of architectural styles are represented and detached garages seem to be a common feature in the area.

### **APPLICANT'S PROPOSAL**

The owners, Will and Gray Hughes, are proposing to construct an addition to the main structure and replace a deteriorated detached garage with a new detached garage in a slightly

different location and with a different orientation. The addition involves an expansion of the first floor to the current edge of the existing deck (to be removed); added square footage on the first floor is approximately 400 SF. The second floor would see an expansion to add a roughly 70 SF bathroom and the attic would likewise be expanded to cover the extension of the second floor. In total, the additions would increase the FAR by approximately 1,000 SF, from 5,317 SF to 6,375 SF. The existing detached garage, with a hip roof and side-facing garage bays, would be demolished. While this existing garage is located behind the house (and minimally visible from the public way), the proposed detached garage, featuring a flat “green” roof, would face the public way and be further offset from the house (and therefore more visible). The new garage would be larger but reasonably consistent in scale with the existing garage.

**FINDINGS**

**Section 5.22: Exceptions to Floor Area Ratio Regulations for Residential Units**

Floor Area Ratio	Maximum	Existing	Proposed	Relief
<b>S-10; 1-family detached dwelling</b>	0.30	0.30	0.36	<b>Special Permit*</b>
	100%	100%	120%	
	5,249sf	5,317sf	6,375sf	

**Section 5.09.2.j: Design Review**

The project consists of an exterior modification for which a special permit is requested pursuant to §5.22, and therefore Design Review is required. Relevant sections of the design review standards are described below. See also the applicant’s Impact Statement.

- Preservation of Trees and Landscape
- Relation of Buildings to Environment
- Relation of Buildings to the Form of the Streetscape and Neighborhood
- Open Space
- Stormwater Drainage
- Utility Service
- Heritage

The addition will not significantly expand the structure and the altered structure and garage will remain completely consistent with the scale and architectural style of other homes in the neighborhood. The addition is also located in the rear and will therefore be minimally visible from the public way. Landscaping is hardly affected, with the only significant impact being the removal of a 22-inch evergreen tree. Stormwater Drainage will be addressed through a stormwater management system subject to review under the Stormwater By-Law. All other aspects of the project would remain unaffected and satisfy the criteria of design review.

**Section 5.43: Exceptions to Yard and Setback Regulations****Section 6.04.5.C.3: Design of All Off-Street Parking Facilities**

Areas of the driveway do not conform to the minimum 5' setback from Section 6.04.5.c.3. The Zoning Board of Appeals may grant relief from these setback requirements if the applicant provides a counterbalancing amenity. No specific counterbalancing amenity has yet been identified but screening would be appropriate.

**Section 8.02: Alteration or Extension**

The existing structure is nonconforming and therefore may be altered as allowed by §8.02.2, provided that no nonconforming condition is increased. The proposal complies with this section.

**PLANNING DEPARTMENT COMMENTS**

The Planning Department is supportive of this proposal. The proposed alteration is a reasonable extension of the existing dwelling that maintains the character of the home as viewed from the public way. The existing run-down detached garage will be replaced with a new one designed with a green roof, thus limiting impervious surface. The proposed work will have a minimal impact on abutters and the proposal generally satisfied all of the criteria and standards for Design Review.

**PLANNING BOARD RECOMMENDATION**

The Planning Board is generally supportive of the proposal, but raised some minor concerns with the stability of the new chimney, the wisdom of a green roof for the garage, and the extent of the driveway towards the southern property line. The Planning Board strongly recommended that the applicant pull the retaining wall and paved area back to the required setback for driveways. In all other aspects, the Planning Board is supportive.

**The Planning Board recommends approval of the site plan by EMB, dated June 5, 2019 and architectural plans by ART Architects, dated May 28, 2019, subject to the following conditions:**

- 1. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall submit a final site plan, floor plans, and elevations subject to the review and approval of the Assistant Director of Regulatory Planning.**
- 2. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall submit a final landscaping plan showing proposed counterbalancing amenities subject to the review and approval of the Assistant Director of Regulatory Planning.**
- 3. Prior to the issuance of a building permit, the applicant shall submit to the Building Commissioner for review and approval for conformance to the Board of Appeals decision: 1) a final site plan stamped and signed by a registered engineer or land surveyor, and 2) evidence that the Board of Appeals decision has been recorded at the Registry of Deeds.**

*vp*

**Subject Site**



**Aerial Photograph - Neighborhood Context**

