

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46
47

Brookline Preservation Commission
MINUTES OF THE June 24, 2021 MEETING
Held Virtually using Zoom Online Software

Commissioners Present:

Elton Elperin, Chair
Richard Panciera, Vice Chair
John Spiers
David Jack
Wendy Ecker
Peter Kleiner

Commissioners Absent:

Elizabeth Armstrong
Jim Batchelor
David King

Elton Elperin – John Spiers vote for David King

Staff: Valerie Birmingham, Tina McCarthy

Mr. Elperin called the meeting to order at 6:30 PM.

Approval of Minutes

Minutes, 1/12/2021

David Jack – no comments

Elton Elperin – line 63, compromise drop quotes

Elton Elperin – motion accept. Wendy Ecker second
All in favor

PUBLIC HEARING –LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICTS

12 Worthington Road (Cottage Farm LHD) – Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace all doors & windows in the home; reconfigure and enlarge windows to the rear of the home; reconstruct the garage; demolish the existing site wall connecting the house and garage and the west library addition to construct a new addition connecting the house and garage; replace a wood gutter with a copper gutter to match the rest of the house; remove a chimney at the rear of the house; install new heat pump condensers & screening fence (Zero Energy Design, applicant). **Precinct 1**

Tina McCarthy presents

Stephanie Horowitz – Architect, introduces case and reasons for application. Trying to achieve energy reduction and convert home to Fossil Fuel Free.

Joseph Pagliuca – owner, thanks.

48
49 Matt Genaze – project architect. Goal of maintaining house character and getting FFF. Differed
50 maintenance. Repoint exterior, repair roof and gutters, trim. Acknowledges that second floor windows
51 are visible. Garage is not structurally sound. Discusses additions over time to the home.
52
53 Peter Kleiner joins meeting
54
55 Elton Elperin – asks if they will do repointing on interior, is it a full gut?
56
57 Matt Genaze – yes. Insulating interior. Brick 2” gap with insulation, 2x4 wall filled with insulation.
58
59 Elton Elperin – large sliders are triple glazed?
60
61 Stephanie Horowitz – yes
62
63 No Public Comment
64
65 Installation of Heat Pumps
66
67 Elton Elperin – describe fence screening
68
69 Matt Genaze – wood slat fence, more wood less space
70
71 Elton Elperin – two at center not screened.
72
73 Matt Genaze – using property line fence
74
75 Elton Elperin – could you not see the condensers over 4’ fence
76
77 Matt Genaze – 6” – 12” visible
78
79 Stephanie Horowitz – could propose taller fence to screen
80
81 Elton Elperin – needs additional screening 49” gap between house and fence
82
83 Stephanie Horowitz – could revisit
84
85 Richard Panciera – screen heat pumps separately
86
87 Elizabeth Armstrong – agrees
88
89 Elton Elperin – removal of the chimney – not essential to character
90
91 Richard Panciera, Wendy Ecker – agree
92
93 Garage
94
95 John Spiers – out of character, part because it faces street

96
97 Wendy Ecker – need to be consistent
98
99 John Spiers – context is clear in neighborhood
100
101 Elton Elperin – Asks if the Commissioners oppose attaching the garage
102
103 BA – there have been others on Norfolk Road. Looks attached already
104
105 Elton Elperin – similar to Devon Road, we did not allow there
106 Reconstructing garage – it means exactly right?
107
108 Wendy Ecker – demolish then reconstruct?
109
110 Matt Genaze – yes
111
112 Elton Elperin – can you reuse brick?
113
114 Matt Genaze – yes, possible 2 walls worth of salvage. Would use on front
115
116 Richard Panciera – support the plan to rebuild. Alterations could be made possibly. Glad its brick.
117
118 Elton Elperin – retain design of doors?
119
120 Matt Genaze – doors swing out along interior of garage. Don't know if we can replicate this operation,
121 may be not.
122
123 Elton Elperin – this is good for a subcommittee to review, we need to see final design.
124
125 David Jack – Asks if the garage will be rebuilt on existing footprint.
126
127 Stephanie Horzwitz – yes. You want to brick garage similar to existing?
128
129 David Jack – yes. Elton Elperin – yes, John Spiers – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes
130
131 Enlarged doors/windows at rear
132
133 Elton Elperin – think they are visible
134
135 David Jack – need site visit
136
137 Elizabeth Armstrong – site wall and grade change, need to see it
138
139 Replacement of doors?
140
141 Stephanie Horzwitz – unique parts of front door to retain. Need to investigate front door, intend to
142 rehabilitate.
143

144 Will address grading in rear, 1' lower than neighboring prop. if approved, not yet designed. Terrace or
145 deck
146
147 Windows
148
149 Elton Elperin – we don't permit and you need it to save energy and go FFF
150
151 Stephanie Horowitz – yes, existing windows causing mortar deterioration above windows due to air
152 leakage
153
154 Elton Elperin – you know you can air seal. Electric is generated by FFF source
155
156 Stephanie Horowitz – commercial grade system with heat pump would be necessary
157
158 Elton Elperin – 1st case the Commission has seen, a renovation with triple glazed windows. Explains
159 energy issues. Want energy analysis of building. This is not a super insulated house. This is not a
160 passive house. Want lifecycle analysis of windows
161
162 Stephanie Horowitz – can supply energy analysis. But not sure about lifecycle analysis.
163
164 Richard Panciera – Notes that lifecycle analysis would change the energy profile of the proposed
165 renovation.
166
167 Elton Elperin – need subcommittee
168
169 Richard Panciera – what are we voting on?
170
171 Elton Elperin – motion approve concept of reconstruct garage, details to be developed, salvage brick;
172 deny addition between garage and house approve removal of chimney; approve heat pumps with
173 screening of those at left.
174
175 David Jack – second. Elizabeth to vote for Jim
176
177 David Jack – yes, John Spiers – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Elton Elperin – yes,
178 Peter Kleiner – yes, Elizabeth Armstrong – abstain, came late.
179
180 Richard Panciera – will be on subcommittee. Elton Elperin – on subcommittee, Peter Kleiner – on
181 subcommittee. Not empowered.
182
183 Elton Elperin – motion form subcommittee to discuss windows, doors, enlarged openings at rear. Not
184 empowered
185
186 Richard Panciera second
187
188
189 David Jack – yes, John Spiers – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Elton Elperin – yes,
190 Peter Kleiner – yes
191

192
193
194
195
196
197
198
199
200
201
202
203
204
205
206
207
208
209
210
211
212
213
214
215
216
217
218
219
220
221
222
223
224
225
226
227
228
229
230
231
232
233
234
235
236
237
238
239

PUBLIC HEARINGS – DEMOLITION

224 Sargent Road, 186 Warren Street, and 190 Warren Street – Request to lift the stay of demolition of the three houses (Dave and Christine Ament, applicant). **Precinct 5**

Valerie Birmingham presents

Dave Ament – owner live on Circuit Road in Brookline

Introduces team 4Key objectives:

Record history of buildings, photography

Restore original carriage house. Not very useful and expensive (committed to it for now)

Original entrance is on property, want to rehab it and make a plaque with history

Want to work with you, hoping to collaborate

Bob Allen – green space has diminished in the neighborhood. This creates green space

Claudia Noory-Ello – at 2400 sq ft, it is clearly an accessory structure glass connector

Doug Jones – landscape architect. Using curb cut at 224 Sargent Road limited impact to roads

Public Comment

Julia Cox – my house is 3500 sq ft. Asks about trees

Dave Ament – cites high 5,000 sq ft for house in the neighborhood; this project not overbuilding neighborhood

Julia Cox – will throw herself in front of bulldozer

Richard Panciera – thanks applicant for efforts. Important to restore entrance to Sargent Road. Torn because of loss of buildings. Don't know what the most important thing to preserve is.

David Jack – 18 months stay? Yes

John Spiers – helpful that 186 is in tough shape. Appreciate landscape architecture. If true then may be support

Elton Elperin – like design of site. Problem is losing 2 historic houses.

What do we get? Hard time with the demos.

Elizabeth Armstrong – right now availability of housing is important. 3 homes → 1 house is difficult to justify

Dave Ament – 190 Warren Street can't be a stand along home. So it is 2 to 1. Don't want to contribute to problem but otherwise a developer would raise everything. We are currently tying up a more affordable house and if we have to wait it won't be available. We will wait.

240 Elizabeth Armstrong – Brookline needs a comprehensive housing plan
241
242 Elton Elperin – no matter what we aren't helping housing with this one
243
244 David Jack – agree with Elizabeth Armstrong. Sad to see 2 houses lost. Can't worry about housing on
245 ad hoc basis.
246
247 Bob Allen – this is long lasting green space. This is a modest home.
248
249 Elton Elperin – the documentation is good but still weak tea. All that waste.
250
251 Wendy Ecker – should not hold up if we can't save
252
253 Elton Elperin – could you do drawings or a model 3D
254
255 Claudia Noory-Ello – could create digital model
256
257 Elton Elperin – architectural drawings would also be good.
258
259 David Jack – think it is reasonable
260
261 Peter Kleiner – could estimate appropriate mitigation and lift
262
263 David Jack – motion approve as submitted with photo document of homes to be demoed. Add
264 drawings or model 3D
265
266 Peter Kleiner – second
267
268 Dave Ament – refuses to provide additional historical research.
269
270 David Jack – yes, John Spiers – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Elton Elperin – yes,
271 Peter Kleiner – yes, Elizabeth Armstrong – yes
272
273
274 **209 Sargent Road** – Request to lift the stay of partial demolition of the house (Sargent Road Realty
275 Trust, applicant). **Precinct 5**
276
277 Valerie Birmingham presents
278
279 Bob Allen – introduces case
280
281 Greg Tankersley – architect explains project
282
283 Elton Elperin – love this house. Slide back the garage, connect from behind.
284
285 Greg Tankersley – did not want a hamster tunnel to garage
286
287 Richard Panciera – also wondering about set back. Is it too nice, detracting from house?

288
289 David Jack – uncomfortable tension with garage so close. Want it push away
290
291 Richard Panciera – should the garage be connected to house
292
293 Wendy Ecker, Elton Elperin – not LHD
294
295 John Spiers – ok with connector idea. Push back a little bit
296
297 Wendy Ecker – I sold this house in the 1980’s. Was a simple house. Important to keep simplicity
298
299 Elton Elperin – worried about losing chimneys.
300
301 Peter Kleiner – garage is great, but giving more space is important
302
303 Greg Tankersley – could move garage back behind connector
304
305 Wendy Ecker – needs chimneys
306
307 Richard Panciera – that’s a lot of chimneys to remove
308
309 Bob Allen – you will never see them
310
311 Richard Panciera – helps to breakdown scale of roof. Character defining feature
312
313 Wendy Ecker – motion form empowered subcommittee to examine garage and connector and
314 chimneys
315 Approve rest
316
317 Elton Elperin – second
318 All vote in favor
319
320 Wendy Ecker on subcommittee, Richard Panciera on subcommittee
321
322
323
324
325 Meeting adjourned at 7:16 PM.