

1  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9  
10  
11  
12  
13  
14  
15  
16  
17  
18  
19  
20  
21  
22  
23  
24  
25  
26  
27  
28  
29  
30  
31  
32  
33  
34  
35  
36  
37  
38  
39  
40  
41  
42  
43  
44  
45  
46  
47

**Brookline Preservation Commission**  
**MINUTES OF THE May 18, 2021 MEETING**  
**Held Virtually using Zoom Online Software**

**Commissioners Present:**

Elton Elperin, Chair  
Richard Panciera, Vice Chair  
David Jack  
John Spiers  
Wendy Ecker  
Elizabeth Armstrong  
Jim Batchelor  
David King  
Peter Kleiner

**Commissioners Absent:**

Elton Elperin asks alternates to vote.

**Staff:** Valerie Birmingham, Tina McCarthy

---

Mr. Elperin called the meeting to order at 6:30 PM.

**Approval of Minutes**

No minutes.

No Public Comment

**PUBLIC HEARINGS – DEMOLITION**

**209 Sargent Road** – Application for the partial demolition of the house (209 Sargent Road Realty Trust, applicant). **Precinct 5**

Valerie Birmingham presents case

Ashley Clark – represents case. Will request a lift. Not demolishing.

Public Comment

Julia Cox – what is planned? Mother spent 4 years there. Significant

Valerie Birmingham – no.

Wendy Ecker – I sold this house back in the 80's

48 David Jack – such a significant house.  
49  
50 Richard Panciera – most beautiful house I have seen in Brookline. Significant  
51  
52 Elizabeth Armstrong – motion uphold significance determination. David Jack seconds the motion.  
53  
54 Richard Panciera – yes. Elton Elperin – yes, John Spiers – yes, David Jack – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes,  
55 Elizabeth Armstrong – yes, Jim Batchelor – yes, David King – yes, Peter Kleiner – yes  
56  
57  
58 **191 Buckminster Road** – Request to lift stay of partial demolition on the house (Pavel and Jennifer  
59 Rabiner, applicants). **Precinct 12**  
60  
61 Tina McCarthy presents  
62  
63 Paul Rabiner – not demolishing. Just removing the bay window Want it to be symmetrical. Want  
64 new efficient windows.  
65  
66 Elton Elperin – are windows original?  
67  
68 Paul Rabiner – don't know, but some are different.  
69  
70 Public Comment  
71  
72 Janet Fierman – known Rabiners for 10 years. What they want to do is consistent. Family is waiting  
73 to move in.  
74  
75 Beth Myers – 201 Buckminster Road. Eclectic and charming house but the changes will improve.  
76 Don't think the windows are original.  
77  
78 Richard Panciera – like a little asymmetry. Do second floor windows get enlarged?  
79  
80 Paul Rabiner – may be like 5/16”  
81  
82 Richard Panciera – will you keep casings?  
83  
84 Paul Rabiner – these are replacement sash except on front due to size changes. Will patch siding to  
85 match existing.  
86  
87 David King – like asymmetric eclectic look of original house. Like 8/8  
88  
89 Paul Rabiner – 6/1 is just something we like and like symmetry  
90  
91 David King – 8/8 makes it look more historic  
92  
93 Elton Elperin – don't think the bay is original. Nice to see more precise dimensioned drawings.  
94  
95 Jim Batchelor – Not in an LHD. I would want to stop this in an LHD, but not otherwise.

96  
97 David Jack – suggestions for homeowner to size dormers?  
98  
99 Elton Elperin – sub to review more detailed drawings? You will draw?  
100  
101 TB – yes, this is just conceptual.  
102  
103 Paul Rabiner – don’t want to be delayed.  
104  
105 John Spiers – the intention is clear  
106  
107 Elton Elperin – motion accept proposal #2 with understanding that it will be reviewed to have second  
108 floor width of first, save casings. David King seconds the motion.  
109 All vote in favor  
110  
111

## 112 PUBLIC HEARINGS – LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICTS

113  
114 **60 High Street (Pill Hill LHD)** – Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct a  
115 glass connector between the rear of the house and garage, redesign the garage door, relocate a kitchen  
116 window, replace a bulkhead, enlarge and alter basement windows and window wells, and install  
117 associated mechanical equipment to convert the existing HVAC system to a high efficiency  
118 condensing boiler. (Aamodt/Plumb Architecture, Construction and Development, applicant).

### 119 **Precinct 4**

120  
121 Valerie Birmingham presents  
122  
123 Andrew Plumb – explains about logic for proposal  
124  
125 Public Comment  
126  
127 Diana Post – High Street, oppose window well.  
128  
129 Scott Scharer – don’t use 14 Allerton as an example. Vents on garage are very close to vent pipes  
130  
131 Thomas Michie – 68 High Street, concerned about window well.  
132  
133 Elton Elperin – glass connector  
134 Nice connector idea. Dubious about glass roof. Make a real roof.  
135  
136 Richard Panciera – like garage conversion. Concerned about roof details.  
137  
138 Jim Batchelor – get rid of glass roof.  
139  
140 David King – Roof is bad.  
141  
142 Window wells (not giant one)  
143 With glass covers

144  
145 Elton Elperin – 3’ deep is fine, opposed to covers.  
146  
147 Richard Panciera – covers are inappropriate  
148  
149 Jim Batchelor – agreed  
150  
151 Terrace Window Well  
152  
153 Richard Panciera – outdoor room concerned about wall around it, don’t put wall.  
154  
155 David King – agree, but also think size is an issue. Would change the feel of the district.  
156  
157 Jim Batchelor – make it the same as the smaller ones. No floor to ceiling glass in historic district  
158 basements.  
159  
160 Garage Door  
161  
162 Elton Elperin – door is nice. Each 3’2” wide. Proposed is fine. No person door  
163  
164 Wendy Ecker – is it historic? They are nice.  
165  
166 Richard Panciera – rectangular doors with transom above. No door inside door.  
167  
168 Basement Door  
169  
170 Elton Elperin – aluminum is against guidelines.  
171  
172 Wendy Ecker – not allowed.  
173  
174 Andrew Plumb – want easy maintenance. This is not historic to build out basements. You won’t see  
175 it.  
176  
177 David King – visible or not? Egress? Do they need to be casements?  
178  
179 Elton Elperin – doesn’t have to be casement if it is big enough.  
180  
181 Vents  
182  
183 Richard Panciera – why down draft? Is this to code?  
184  
185 Relocated Window  
186  
187 Elton Elperin – makes sense in plan  
188  
189 Elton Elperin – subcommittee?  
190  
191 David King agrees

192  
193 Elton Elperin – motion continue to subcommittee, back to full. Applicant OK?  
194  
195 Andrew Plumb – yes  
196  
197 David Jack seconds the motion  
198  
199 Richard Panciera – yes, Elton Elperin – yes, John Spiers – yes, David Jack – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes,  
200 Elizabeth Armstrong – yes, Jim Batchelor – yes, David King – yes, Peter Kleiner – yes  
201  
202 Site visit first, for subcommittee to assess impact.  
203  
204 Subcommittee – David King, Richard Panciera, John Spiers  
205  
206  
207 **189 Babcock Street (Graffam McKay LHD)** –Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to  
208 install a new basement entry on Babcock Street, replace all vinyl windows with Marvin Elevate  
209 composite windows, modify the rear decks installing new stairs, install new sliding glass or French  
210 doors on all floors at the rear, install vents, exterior lights and fire alarm equipment. (189 Babcock  
211 LLC, applicant). **Precinct 8**  
212  
213 James Bailey – architect – want to affect exterior as little as possible. Replacing windows in-kind.  
214 Vents on back, not front.  
215  
216 Public Comment  
217  
218 Paul Johnson – 187 Babcock Street, window are improvement concerned with front entry. Whole  
219 basement is being lowered. Areaway is being eliminated, main stair extended to basement. Lighting  
220 plan shows future unit. Front entry is forward of existing stoop. Subordinates the stoop.  
221  
222 Cindy Lee – 191 Babcock Street. Opposition. Abutter on party wall. Front basement door does not  
223 respect historic façade. Also oppose back decks.  
224  
225 Isodora Perez – want ADA access for the building. In the future dimensions are the same as 187 but  
226 wider and deeper. Trying to match 187, but with ADA access.  
227  
228 New Entry on Front  
229  
230 Elton Elperin – we don’t allow this. Can’t see why it is required.  
231  
232 Elizabeth Armstrong – agree  
233  
234 Jim Batchelor – not appropriate  
235  
236 Peter Kleiner – housing shortage in Brookline, try to do it without compromising the original building.  
237 Don’t see reason.  
238  
239 Window Replacement

240  
241 Jim Batchelor – precedent  
242  
243 Elizabeth Armstrong – yes, speaks to it  
244  
245 John Spiers – these windows are not a character defining feature. Support.  
246  
247 Richard Panciera – No issue. Support.  
248  
249 Stairs and Deck at Rear  
250  
251 Elton Elperin – these will tower over other back yards. Not sure why they are required.  
252  
253 James Bailey – stairs are to access backyard from units. (architect)  
254  
255 Richard Panciera – could they go 90° turned?  
256  
257 James Bailey – rotating stairs is a zoning violation  
258  
259 Richard Panciera – no other buildings access yard via stairs.  
260  
261 James Bailey – yes  
262  
263 John Spiers – very large footprint. No safety egress need.  
264  
265 Isodora Perez – the landings are staggered to decks, for privacy  
266  
267 John Spiers – subcommittee  
268  
269 Elton Elperin – yes, subcommittee, okay with sliding doors at rear.  
270  
271 Jim Batchelor – basement is curious, excavating floor to create space for storage? People can use  
272 basement for backyard access.  
273  
274 Elton Elperin – lights seem fine.  
275  
276 Jim Batchelor – review in subcommittee  
277  
278 Peter Kleiner – motion refer to subcommittee report back. Elton Elperin second  
279  
280 Isodora Perez – would work with subcommittee. Would remove rear stairs. Would remove front  
281 entry.  
282  
283 Lights Discussion  
284  
285 Richard Panciera – just want to make sure it's not too much. Not shielded  
286  
287 Jim Batchelor – small subcommittee, empowered

288  
289 Applicant agrees to subcommittee  
290  
291 Jim Batchelor – motions to approve with no new front entrance, no rear deck stairs, and empowered  
292 subcommittee of 1 to review lighting.  
293  
294 Elton Elperin seconds the motion.  
295 All vote in favor. Jim Batchelor on subcommittee.  
296  
297  
298 Meeting adjourned.

DRAFT