

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46

Brookline Preservation Commission
MINUTES OF THE March 25, 2021 MEETING
Held Virtually using Zoom Online Software

Commissioners Present:

Elton Elperin, Chair
Richard Panciera, Vice Chair
David King
Wendy Ecker
John Spiers, Alternate
David Jack
Elizabeth Armstrong, Alternate
Jim Batchelor

Commissioners Absent:

Peter Kleiner

Staff: Valerie Birmingham, Tina McCarthy

Mr. Elperin called the meeting to order at 6:30 PM.

Approval of Minutes

No minutes.

Public Comment

PUBLIC HEARINGS – LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICTS

22 Dunster Road (Chestnut Hill North LHD) –Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install AC condensers and vent pipes (Leo Power III, applicant). **Precinct 13**

Brian Alim – no comment

Richard Panciera – condensers are fine, no issue. Elton Elperin agrees, motions to approve. David King second.

David Jack – vote individually?

Elton Elperin – think all are acceptable could be one motion. David Jack – fine.
All comment Electrical Box is fine.

Richard Panciera – boiler vent, can be painted?

Brian Alim – could be match siding.

47
48 Elton Elperin, Richard Panciera – paint it.
49
50 Elton Elperin – asks to put around corner, keep away from window.
51
52 Brian Alim – ideal to leave there, beneath window.
53
54 David King – what are the vents? In roof
55
56 David Jack – are they installed?
57
58 Brian Alim – yes
59
60 Richard Panciera – better in roof than anywhere else. Best location.
61
62 David King – painted.
63
64 Brian Alim – they are stainless.
65
66 Richard Panciera – stainless will blend with roof, no objection.
67
68 Elton Elperin – nice gate.
69
70 David Jack – paint your PVC vent black as penance for retro approval.
71
72 Davie King – motion approve as submitted; bathroom and boiler vent to be painted to match the house.
73
74 Elizabeth Armstrong – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Elton Elperin – yes, David King – yes. Wendy
75 Ecker – yes, David Jack – yes, John Spiers – yes, Jim Batchelor - yes
76
77 Elizabeth Armstrong – why is this retro
78
79 Brian Alim – these items are not reviewed in other Towns.
80
81 Jim Batchelor – did you get a building permit
82
83 Tina McCarthy & Valerie Birmingham – explain about mechanical permits & difficulty with
84 contractors.
85
86 David King – suggests adding vents and condensers to application
87
88 John Spiers – how is this getting communicated to homeowners?
89
90 Elizabeth Armstrong – we talked about this earlier. “What do we review” – all openings. Think it is
91 clear?
92
93 Valerie Birmingham and Tina McCarthy – commit to meet and educate building inspectors and
94 highlight approval of vents and condensers in future LHD mailing

95
96 Jim Batchelor – Staff should ask about mechanical systems.
97
98
99 **PUBLIC HEARINGS – DEMOLITION**
100
101 **186 Warren Street** – Application for the demolition of the house, garage and shed (David and
102 Christine Ament, applicants). **Precinct 5**
103
104 Valerie Birmingham presents.
105
106 Bob Allen – we will discuss all together?
107
108 Elton Elperin – it won't take that long
109
110 Bob Allen – will wait to talk about all three. Introduces Dave & Christina Ament, owners. Residents
111 of Chestnut Hill N. Not a development. A family doing a preservation project at 190 Warren Street.
112 This parcel was subdivided 3 times. Property lines moved, placed restrictive covenants and common
113 driveway. Deed restrictions require ownership of all three understand significance. Excited to come
114 back.
115
116 Public Comment
117
118 Julia Cox – new neighbors of applicants. Appreciate history. Historic house, concerned about demo.
119 Richardson house is under consideration for LHD. Consider this, think about history.
120
121 Lynn Nyhart – Virginia Nyhart – (Nina) 185 Warrant Street, 40 years, concerned about demolition,
122 want more information.
123
124 Elton Elperin – just significance tonight.
125
126 Charles Tynan – consider the names, lived in Brookline 69 years. Lived here, knew these people.
127 Demo will not enhance memory of community. The value is in history.
128
129 Elton Elperin – house first.
130
131 Wendy Ecker – obviously significant.
132
133 David Jack – want to ask about garage.
134
135 Elton Elperin – lets vote on house. Motion uphold house significant. David Jack second.
136 All vote in favor.
137
138 Garage – Richard Panciera – not significant. Jim Batchelor motion not significant garage. Elton
139 Elperin second.
140 All vote in favor.
141

142 Shed – Richard Panciera – fine Walpole Woodworkers shed. Richard Panciera motion not significant.
143 David Jack second.
144 All vote in favor.
145
146
147 **190 Warren Street** – Application for the partial demolition of the house (David and Christine
148 Ament, applicants). **Precinct 5**
149
150 Valerie Birmingham presents.
151
152 Bob Allen – nothing to add, significant
153
154 Public Comment
155
156 Julia Cox – fabulous house. Is significant. Should be preserve. Cow barn was on Codman Road and
157 Sargent Road.
158
159 David King and David Jack – uphold
160 David King motion uphold. David Jack second.
161 All vote in favor.
162
163
164 **224 Sargent Road** – Application for the demolition of the house and shed (David and Christine
165 Ament, applicants). **Precinct 5**
166
167 Valerie Birmingham presents.
168
169 David Ament – 15 years living on Circuit Road. Optimistic about working with commission.
170
171 Elton Elperin – this is a confusing house.
172
173 Public Comment
174
175 Julia Cox – this house is across from me. Not my favorite but well built. Use the Warrant Street
176 address, who cares about Sargent Road. Won't fight it but sad. Part of Sargent legacy.
177
178 Charles Tynan – didn't see plans.
179
180 Wendy Ecker – same contractor built mine, same door windows.
181
182 David King – not sure if architecturally significant. Historically significant. Is an albatross.
183
184 Wendy Ecker – history counts.
185
186 Richard Panciera – want to hear what Julia has to say.
187
188 Richard Panciera – should be preserved, has character. Should be preserved.
189

190 Jim Batchelor – complex of properties have an interesting history. Eclectic houses are interesting too.
191
192 David King – significant. Motion uphold determination of significance. Jim Batchelor second.
193 All vote in favor.
194
195 Julia Cox – Guy Lowell was famous in Boston.
196
197 Elton Elperin – motion significant on Coop. Richard Panciera second.
198 All vote in favor.
199
200
201 **17 Hart Street** – Application for the demolition of the house (Alexander Neary and Zi Ye, applicants).
202 **Precinct 5**
203
204 Bob Allen – represents, structural deficiencies. Bob Allen’s mother grew up at Whiskey Point.
205 Double lot, could make a better house. 888 sq. ft. house. Doesn’t make sense to renovate financially.
206
207 Zi & Alex Neary – house has structural issues. More money than worth. Have talked to neighbors.
208 Want to work with commission.
209
210 Public Comment
211
212 Meighan Rock – these are the workers houses that served the estates. Unique to Brookline. Removal
213 would disrupt the whole street. Strong opposition. Develop plan for restoration.
214
215 Resident of Hart Street – not substandard homes.
216
217 Charles Tynan – I am a relative of Bob Allen. Live on the street, been there all my life. This building
218 is not substandard. Committed to stop this if not consistent with street.
219
220 Aaron Price – 10 Hart Street. Agree with previous speakers. Preserve.
221
222 Anne Lusk – I got a preservation award by Dennis DeWitt for my restoration. Love Benjamin Bradley.
223 Did not evict residents when they couldn’t pay. I use to have a toilet in my basement. All other Irish
224 Catholic workers homes are torn down.
225
226 John Radley – owned 11 Hart Street in family 90 years. The structure is not sound. Know Bob Allen.
227
228 Michael Wolf – 16 Hart Street – agree with Ann Meighan, Aaron. This tells the complete story of
229 Brookline.
230
231 Elton Elperin – I was surprised by this street, agree it is unique. Historic.
232
233 David Jack – agree, read as an ensemble. Consider creating an LHD.
234
235 Wendy Ecker – agree. Should make LHD.
236
237 Jim Batchelor – so wonderful that this street exists, critical to protect.

238
239 Elton Elperin motion uphold significance. Wendy Ecker second.
240 All vote in favor.
241
242
243 Motion meeting adjourned 8:45 PM.

DRAFT