

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46

Brookline Preservation Commission
MINUTES OF THE February 9, 2021 MEETING
Held Virtually using Zoom Online Software

Commissioners Present:

Elton Elperin, Chair
Richard Panciera, Vice Chair
David King
Wendy Ecker
Peter Kleiner
David Jack
Elizabeth Armstrong, Alternate
John Spiers, Alternate
Jim Batchelor

Commissioners Absent:

Staff: Valerie Birmingham, Tina McCarthy

Mr. Elperin called the meeting to order at 6:30 PM.

Approval of Minutes

Minutes 10/27/2020

Elton Elperin – no comments. Motion approve minutes. Wendy Ecker second. All vote in favor.

Minutes 12/8/2020

Elton Elperin – Line 80 – add “might be allowed as an exception”

Line 89 – intersect the existing gambrel? Change

Minutes approved with changes. David King second. All in favor.

PUBLIC HEARINGS – LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICTS

173-175 Walnut Street (Pill Hill LHD) –Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to install fencing at the side and front property lines and make changes to the grade in the front yard. (Storey Condominium, applicants). **Precinct 5**

Jeremy Wong – owner, no comments

No Public Comments

David Jack – height of existing fences?

Jeremy Wong – 6’ & 42”

47
48 Wendy Ecker – photo of step down?
49
50 Jeremy Wong – take advice on that
51
52 Elton Elperin – improvement in landscaing.
53 One path & one gate.
54
55 Jeremy Wong – no, other examples on street
56
57 Elton Elperin – 6’ to front of house is fine. Lower in front yard - should be.
58
59 David King – agree.
60
61 Jeremy Wong – can lower to 42”
62
63 Elton Elperin – will be near other front fence @ 42”.
64 Photograph is more open than drawing. Better in photo, copy that spacing.
65
66 Jeremy Wong – can do.
67
68 Jim Batchelor – good proposal, nice to have front fence @ side back to house. Should be more
69 open.
70
71 Jeremy Wong – oppose, don’t like look, but if you want it ok. Tapered?
72
73 Jim Batchelor – thanks.
74
75 Elton Elperin – with Jim Batchelor but less strong.
76
77 David King – makes sense for 2 fences same height, same design. No taper
78
79 Jim Batchelor – have to check. Can they do without steps.
80
81 Elton Elperin – curb. Why?
82
83 Jim Batchelor – like look. Don’t like front yard slope. Looks absurd want level front yard.
84
85 Elton Elperin – historic practice is common front yard. Something is lost.
86
87 Richard Panciera – step up curb to get to walk?
88
89 Jeremy Wong – step and gate set back from curb. 3’ x 3’ low area, then step
90

91 Richard Panciera – precedent for curb and fence. 87 Walnut; 163 Walnut with black or metal
92 fence. But understand what you are saying. Not biggest deal. Step into yard is nice but not
93 accessible.

94
95 Jim Batchelor – accept with modification to use picket along left to front corner of house.
96 Spacing and size to match photo.

97
98 Elton Elperin Second. All vote in favor.

99
100
101 **131 Carlton Street (Cottage Farm LHD)** – Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to
102 construct a single car garage, remove basement window and well, remove and install fencing, patio
103 and pavers, demolition and construction of side porch and stairs, replace side door, construct new
104 wall (Evan and Amy Lieberman, applicants). **Precinct 1**

105
106 Valerie Birmingham presents.

107
108 Jennifer DoPazo Gilbert – introduces applicants. Architect will share clarifications

109
110 Sheldon Baker makes a slideshow.

111
112 Public Comment

113
114 Ken Goldstein – represent abutters @ 33 Euston. Want to support but mitigate impact. Garage
115 is on property line. No room for fence between garage and property line. Will accept a wood
116 fence between their property and garage. Gap between house and garage means no room for
117 fence. Restriction on height also impacts abutters. Relax requirements for abutter’s sake.
118 Concerned about trees.

119
120 Valerie Birmingham – space between garage and house does not exist in this proposal

121
122 Jennifer DoPazo Gilbert – yes, we can address some of these concerns

123
124 Kate Poverman – accident! No comment.

125
126 Jim Batchelor – talk about areas as whole.

127
128 Jennifer DoPazo Gilbert – we are prepared to make changes.

129
130 Elton Elperin – a1.2 floor plan, garage. Fence will be glued to garage.

131
132 Sheldon Baker – metal siding not required on neighbors side. 2’ gap garage to house, narrow
133 garage to 11’6” makes room to put fence. Eliminate parapet.

134
135 Elton Elperin – low wall in rear?

136

137 Sheldon Baker – Salvage stone from patio.
138
139 Elton Elperin – match foundation?
140
141 Sheldon Baker – yes.
142
143 Elton Elperin – rubber roof visible? SB – yes.
144
145 David King – side of garage vertical?
146
147 Sheldon Baker – not metal, cedar. Vertical to match fence.
148
149 David King – door metal roll up?
150
151 Sheldon Baker – yes, due to sloped roof.
152
153 Elton Elperin – if detached, flat?
154
155 Sheldon Baker – current minimizes visibility.
156
157 David King – right place for garage. Sloped roof is ok. Low garage.
158
159 Elton Elperin – clever solution. Like landscape element.
160
161 Richard Panciera – Not prominent feature, ok.
162
163 Jim Batchelor – ok.
164
165 Elizabeth Armstrong – appreciate detached garage. Good solution.
166
167 Elton Elperin – Elizabeth Armstrong vote for Peter. Elizabeth Armstrong – yes.
168
169 Elton Elperin – Motion move garage to sub, approve general idea. Empowered subcommittee
170 David King – second. Don't like horizontal railing.
171
172 Elton Elperin – I have questions about stone wall.
173 David King second.
174
175 Peter Kleiner left meeting.
176
177 David King – yes. David Jack – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, Elton Elperin – yes, Jim Batchelor –
178 yes, Elizabeth Armstrong – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, John Spiers – yes.
179
180 Richard Panciera on sub with David King & Elton Elperin.
181
182

183
184 **PUBLIC HEARINGS – DEMOLITION**
185
186 **1684 Beacon Street** – Request to lift the stay of partial demolition on the building (Beacon 19
187 Properties LLC, applicants). **Precinct 13**
188
189 Valerie Birmingham presents.
190
191 Owen Thomas – architect goes over design.
192
193 Public Comment
194
195 Virginia Smith – like proposal
196 Ken Rosen - @ 1680. How long will project take?
197 JDG – we will address @ Planning Board meeting.
198
199 David Jack – rear is public?
200
201 Valerie Birmingham – no and not in LHD.
202
203 David Jack – windows original
204
205 Owen Thomas – many are.
206
207 Elton Elperin – penalization of fiber board cement. Makes tiny pieces
208
209 David King – I like the overhang. Otherwise it is too flat.
210
211 Richard Panciers – go wild on that cornice. Beacon Street Cornice. Boston Sash new windows.
212 At dormer in 1980 meeting rails aligned. Please align up your rails.
213
214 David Jack – good catch. Otherwise great. Keep cornice at rear.
215
216 Owen Thomas – roof will repair in kind.
217
218 Elton Elperin – meeting rails align, align seams to window openings.
219 Motion to accept with these changes. David King second.
220
221 David King – yes. David Jack – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, Elton Elperin – yes, Jim Batchelor –
222 yes, Elizabeth Armstrong – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, John Spiers – yes.
223
224
225 **16 Harrison Street** – Application for the full demolition of the detached garage (Kelsey and Andrew
226 Miller, applicants). **Precinct 3**
227
228 Valerie Birmingham presents.

229
230 Jennifer DoPazo Gilbert – introduces architect Monika Pauli
231
232 Monika Pauli – agree with history but too much change and poor condition.
233
234 No Public Comment
235
236 Wendy Ecker – significant
237
238 Richard Panciera- agree with Wendy. Others have been significant.
239
240 David King – we can find significant and then lift stay and allow demo.
241
242 Elton Elperin – increasingly hard to preserve these. We have LHDs for that level of protection.
243
244 Jim Batchelor – have there been other Brook Skinner garages saved?
245
246 John Spiers – asks about what parameters are – could all be gradually demo by neglect?
247
248 Jim Batchelor – should find significant because it is standing vertical. Do wish for inventory of
249 preserved garages.
250
251 Com discusses past cases.
252
253 Elton Elperin – should not save outside LHDs.
254
255 David King – agree.
256
257 David King – Motion uphold significant. Wendy Ecker second.
258
259 David King – yes. David Jack – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, Elton Elperin – yes, Jim Batchelor –
260 yes, Elizabeth Armstrong – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, John Spiers – yes.
261
262
263 **93 Seaver Street** – Application for the full demolition of the house (93 Viewpoint LLC, applicant).
264 **Precinct 14**
265
266 Jacob Walters – lawyer. Purchased in July.
267
268 Lucio Trabucco – architect. Vacant. Needs to be gutted. No insulation. Iron fence is rotted.
269
270 Public Comment
271
272 Myron Spector – abutters, share driveway 30 years residents. This house was occupied through
273 the spring. Important home 100 years of protections in neighborhood. House can be upgraded.
274

275 Carlos Ridruejo – TMM, architect and resident of neighborhood. Present owners removed heat.
276 Approach is demo by neglect. Extensive renovations should be expected. No reason to demo.
277
278 Vinca Jarrett – attorney. Criminal to tear down. Lawyer and builder have misrepresented. This
279 is what Brookline stands for.
280
281 Gary King – abutters – endorse all comments. Former owners were elderly, repairs understood.
282 Where did attorney get idea of unoccupied?
283
284 Jacob Walter – have not been inside house, told it was unoccupied. Saw photos of interior.
285 Impression given condition. Apologies.
286
287 Elton Elperin – true oil tank removed?
288
289 Jacob Walters – may be
290
291 Lucio Trabucco – was heated by oil.
292
293 Virginia Smith – TMM Pct 4. Care about historic arch. This is a gem. This is demo by neglect.
294 Can be restore.
295
296 Mairo Pinto – owner of house. Inside asbestos everywhere.
297
298 Joseph Smith – 83 Seaver Street neighbor. Not abandoned. Beautiful
299
300 Arthur Segel – Brooklyn resident. Spent many holidays at this home beautiful views and nice
301 layout.
302
303 Sam Lux – former owner. Wife died last year. Did not use upstairs. Systems are old but outside
304 is well maintained. No asbestos except in basement. House is in reasonable shape.
305
306 Pam Lodish – 120 Seaver. Offended by applicant presentation. How can oil tank be removed?
307
308 Mini Kolluri – 67 Buckminster. Everyone here appreciates their homes.
309
310 Joshua Sparrow – in favor of affordable housing? Joy to pass by these beautiful homes.
311 Financial motive deprives us of sense of place.
312
313 Elton Elperin - ?
314
315 Richard Panciers – significant.
316
317 David Jack – beautiful and NR
318
319 David King – what can we do about the heat?
320

321 Jim Batchelor – we don't know all of circumstance. Lets figure this out.
322
323 Tina McCarthy – will take up with Building Dept.
324
325 David Jack – talks about letter and intent to demolish.
326
327 Jim Batchelor – Motion significant. Elton Elperin second.
328
329 David King – yes. David Jack – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, Elton Elperin – yes, Jim Batchelor –
330 yes, Elizabeth Armstrong – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, John Spiers – yes.
331
332
333 **116 Thorndike Street** – Application for the full demolition of the house (116 Thorndike Street,
334 LLC, applicant). **Precinct 9**
335
336 Daniel Gersh – purchased, understand delay. Street is appealing. Want to capture architecture
337 of past.
338
339 Public Comment
340
341 Vinca Jarrett – 160 Thorndike, knew former owners. Lots of restoration by former owners.
342 Beautiful home, makes neighborhood.
343
344 Susan Regan – abutter. Agree. This style defines neighborhood.
345
346 Nicole Reindorf – Thorndike, 5 houses down. This is why I moved here. Interiors could never
347 be replicated.
348
349 Mark Rosen – agree. Beautiful. Why people come to Brookline. Live in McKay Home.
350
351 Lee osenbaum & Marilyn, 73 Coolidge Street. Love neighborhood.
352
353 Iya Kessler- 120 Thorndike – for 5 years. Love architecture here upset. Want to talk with
354 developer.
355
356 Tania Schlatter – 121 Thorndike. Unique design. Nothing like it.
357
358 Joshua Sparrow – 93 Thorndike. Only center tower. Critical to preserve North Brookline.
359 Accessible for all to enjoy.
360
361 Hildy Grossman – Next door, white house 30 years. Most beautiful house on street. What do
362 we care about? Been inside house marvelous paneling. Fine shape.
363
364 Edward Bumas – live on Thorndike 23 years – love home. Irreplaceable. 40+ neighbors
365 engaging in the last few days. United and supported.
366

367 Virginia Smith – do not see as beautiful but has character hilarious and magical.
368
369 Sloat Shaw – Thorndike, support significance
370
371 Andrew Liebman – live in neighborhood.
372
373 Miguel Liebman – live on Thorndike, close by. We wanted to buy 116, beautiful.
374
375 David Jack – significant.
376
377 Elton Elpherin – appreciate Virginia Smith’s comment, dramatic house
378
379 Richard Panciera – comments on unusual design
380
381 Jim Batchelor – significant. Live pretty close to house. LHD discussions? Teardowns
382 eventually change the character.
383 Motion uphold significance.
384
385 Elton Elperin second.
386
387 David King – yes, David Jack – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, Elton Elperin – yes, Jim Batchelor –
388 yes, Elizabeth Armstrong – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, John Spiers – yes.
389
390
391 The meeting adjourned 9:57 PM.