

1
2
3
4
5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
26
27
28
29
30
31
32
33
34
35
36
37
38
39
40
41
42
43
44
45
46

Brookline Preservation Commission
MINUTES OF THE December 14, 2021 MEETING
Held Virtually using Zoom Online Software

Commissioners Present:

Elton Elperin, Chair
David King
David Jack
Elizabeth Armstrong, Alternate
Wendy Ecker
John Spiers, Alternate
Richard Panciera, Vice Chair
Peter Kleiner
Jim Batchelor
Alex Villanueva, Alternate

Commissioners Absent:

Staff: Tina McCarthy, Jacob Collins

Elton Elperin starts the meeting.

Minutes

Minutes 4/13/2021

David King – line 192, Neighborhoods are right- this should read agree with neighbors’ comment. On line 251 Michael Gorom states– Planning would do either, asks what this means.

Richard Panciera explains – elevator or no elevator.

Richard Panciera – motion – Approve minutes of April 13 with changes described. David Jack seconds.

David King – yes. Wendy Ecker – yes, David Jack – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Jim Batchelor – abstain, Peter Kleiner - yes

Minutes 10/27/2021

John Spiers – list John Spiers as alternate. Do not include alternate votes unless officially voting.

Richard Panciera – motion accept with John Spiers correction. David Jack seconded.

David King – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, David Jack – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Jim Batchelor – yes, Peter Kleiner – yes

47 Minutes 11/9/2021
48
49 John Spiers – also list me as any alternate and remove me from votes.
50
51 Wendy Ecker – motion approve with correction. David King seconded.
52
53 David King – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, David Jack – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Jim Batchelor
54 – yes, Peter Kleiner – yes
55

56
57 Minutes 11/22/2021

58
59 John Spiers – list me as an alternate.

60
61 David King – line 94: Elton Elperin – make a sketch, everything. → of everything.

62
63 Richard Panciera – motion approve with correction. Elton Elperin seconded.

64
65 David King – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, David Jack – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Jim Batchelor
66 – yes
67

68
69 Public Comment

70
71 Melissa Trevvett – speaks about fairness in LHDs. Concerned about Retroactive COAS. Some
72 on Babcock Street. Wants enforcement and penalties for those not following the Guidelines.
73

74 Elton Elperin – explains recent discussions and intent to follow up with violations.
75

76 Tina McCarthy – explains enforcement efforts in Town and education opportunities.
77

78 Sylvia Baldwin – Columbia Street resident. Will speak during case.
79

80 Mari Oktlo – asks about demo review process and how Commission ensures replacement
81 buildings are appropriate.
82

83 Elton Elperin – explains the demo process and lack of such review after the demolition stay
84 expires.
85

86
87 **PUBLIC HEARINGS- LOCAL HISTORIC DISTRICTS**

88
89 **127 Crafts Road** – Application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for roof and door replacement
90 on the detached garage (Meghan Baker, applicant). **Precinct 13**

91
92 Jake Collins made the presentation

93
94 Meghan Baker – just want to improve garage which is falling apart.
95
96 Elton Elperin – guidelines ask for wood.
97
98 No Public Comment
99
100 Wendy Ecker – steel doors are standard these days.
101
102 Richard Panciera – want it to be wood. Existing door looks like a pair of doors. The proposed
103 is more modern looking.
104
105 Elton Elperin – wood garage doors are readily available, recommends using wood. Shingles on
106 the roof are appropriate, no objection.
107
108 Richard Panciera – No objection to shingles replacing metal roof.
109
110 David King – agrees about doors being wood.
111
112 Elton Elperin – motion to approve the replacement of the metal roof with asphalt shingles; but
113 request resubmission of the door in wood, details of door review to staff.
114
115 David Jack seconds.
116
117 David King – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, David Jack – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Jim Batchelor
118 – yes, Peter Kleiner – yes. Elton Elperin – yes
119
120
121 **189 Babcock Street** – Continued application for a Certificate of Appropriateness to construct rear
122 decks and install lighting (189 Babcock LLC, applicant). **Precinct 8**
123
124 Tina McCarthy made the presentation.
125
126 Isidoro – explains intentions for application.
127
128 Public Comment
129
130 Cindy Lee – asks about the stairs and zoning.
131
132 Tina McCarthy – we cannot rule on zoning
133
134 Cindy Lee – is the head house bigger?
135
136 Isidoro, owner – the head house is about the height of the railing. Is further from edge as well,
137 you cannot see it from the street.
138

139 Cindy Lee – is the roof deck bigger than originally proposed?
140
141 Isidoro – no.
142
143 Cindy Lee – raises zoning issues again.
144
145 Alex Villanueva – asks about purpose of public comment period, and whether the questions are
146 appropriate.
147
148 Elton Elperin – confirms that the questions may be asked, but that the Commission does not rule
149 on zoning issues.
150
151 Paul Johnson, 187 Babcock Street – believe stair needs zoning review. No issue with enlarged
152 deck. Aligns with neighbor. Condensers are now in alcove, can they go back to the roof. Asks
153 about gas meters on front.
154
155 Isidoro – had plans to put meters on inside but the laws have changed and they got moved to
156 front.
157
158 Jim Batchelor – why are we approving Trex?
159
160 Tina McCarthy – it is already approved, in an earlier COA for this continued application.
161
162 Elton Elperin – okay with decks and lights.
163
164 John Spiers – agree.
165
166 Alex Villanueva – agree. Happy with the lights.
167
168 Richard Panciera – motion accept as presented. Elton Elperin seconded.
169
170 David King – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, David Jack – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Jim Batchelor
171 – abstain, Peter Kleiner – yes. Elton Elperin – yes
172
173
174 **34 Francis Street-** Application for a Retroactive Certificate of Appropriateness to install a 4-zone
175 ductless heat pump system with associated piping and screening (Atlantic Heating & Air
176 Conditioning Co, applicant). **Precinct 3**
177
178 Tina McCarthy made the presentation.
179
180 Tim Woods – explained that they are still waiting for the installation of the condenser screening.
181
182 Peter Kleiner – speaks about the subcommittee review. Were okay with the remaining pipe.
183 Visibility is minimal. Condenser screening is okay.
184

185 David King – considers the proposal an improvement. Motion approve as submitted. David
186 Jack seconded.
187
188 David King – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, David Jack – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Jim Batchelor
189 – yes, Peter Kleiner – yes. Elton Elperin – yes
190
191
192 **61 Hedge Road** – Application for the full demolition of the garage (Ken Berman & Katie
193 Pasciucco, applicants). **Precinct 5**
194
195 Jake Collins made the presentation
196
197 Katie Pasciucco, owner –Bought house 4 years ago and garage was in very poor condition.
198 Concerned about structural integrity of garage. Cannot be repaired, would like to rebuild.
199
200 Peter Grover, architect – the garage is deteriorated, front door header is undersized and rafters
201 are dangerously deteriorated. Needs to be bigger. Want the new garage to be historically
202 appropriate.
203
204 Asher Nichols – I asked the owners not to let the kids go in. There should be a center column in
205 the bay but there is not.
206
207 No public comment.
208
209 Wendy Ecker – it should go due to safety concerns.
210
211 David Jack – like to preserve if we can, but there are serious structural issues. Would like
212 drawings of it before demolished. Salvage materials if possible.
213
214 Alex Villanueva – need to remove if unsafe.
215
216 David King – looks better than some. I have not seen it in person. Believe the architects
217 assessment but believe it could be restored. It is significant.
218
219 Katie Pasciucco – it has aluminum siding. May be wood underneath.
220
221 Elton Elperin – in an LHD it may be different; this is not an LHD. Motion to demolish the
222 garage.
223
224 David Jack – asks about documentation.
225
226 Elizabeth Armstrong – we have to find it significant or not.
227
228 Jim Batchelor – typically, we find it significant and work out mitigation through lift.
229
230 Elton Elperin – withdraw motion.

231
232 David King – motion uphold significance. We can work with them on a lift. Jim Batchelor
233 seconds.
234
235 David King – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, David Jack – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Jim Batchelor
236 – yes, Peter Kleiner – yes. Elton Elperin – yes
237 .
238
239
240 **116 Columbia Street**—Application for the full demolition of the house (116 Columbia Street LLC,
241 applicant). **Precinct 9**
242
243 Jake Collins makes the presentation
244
245 Applicant is not present
246
247 Public Comment
248
249 Sylvia Baldwin – live in the blue house at 120 Columbia Street. Concerned about new
250 construction, designs on Verndale Street by same developer have fake mansard roofs. Pollution
251 from demo and vacant lot left for a year. Neighbors have no say. No knowledge of future
252 development, this is wrong. This street is moderately priced housing, replaced by luxury condos
253 2.5 million and up. Want Brookline to take care of its neighborhoods.
254
255 Richard Lanza – common theme of buildings being lost. Makes neighborhood homogeneous
256 and less affordable. Keep the building.
257
258 Diane Lande – live next to this house. Verndale buildings are inconsistent with neighborhood
259 and excessively expensive. See no reason for demolition. Want it to be restored. Concerned
260 about environmental impact. This is as significant as any of previous applications.
261
262 Mari Kotlov – live in apartment in gray building. Noise from construction and pollution from
263 demo. Our friends live in the house, it is in great condition. Tearing it down is wrong. Object
264 to eyesore homes on Verndale. Devastating to neighborhood.
265
266 David Jack – agrees with comments, speaks to neighborhood context.
267
268 Elton Elperin – speaks about architectural details and supports significance.
269
270 Alex Villanueva – use to live at 124 Columbia. Verndale is negatively impacted by
271 redevelopment. We do need to add housing stock but this demolition is a disservice to the Town.
272 These homes are needed family rental properties. These set the character of street. These are
273 affordable homes for families. Find it significant.
274
275 Elton Elperin – motion uphold the finding of significance. David Jack seconded.
276

277 David King – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, David Jack – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Jim Batchelor
278 – yes, Peter Kleiner – yes. Elton Elperin – yes

279

280

281 **130 Warren Street**—Application for the partial demolition of the existing home (130 Warren Street
282 Realty Trust, applicant). **Precinct 5**

283

284 Tina McCarthy made the presentation.

285

286 Bob Allen – house has been altered; will work with Commission. Agree with significance.

287

288 Public Comment

289

290 Ephraim Hochburg – live in yellow house, next door. Extraordinary house. Very architecturally
291 interesting find it significant.

292

293 David Jack – second Bob Allen’s recommendation commission comments. Motion find it
294 significant. Elton Elperin seconded.

295

296 David King – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, David Jack – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Jim Batchelor
297 – yes, Peter Kleiner – yes. Elton Elperin – yes

298

299

300 **OTHER BUSINESS:**

301

302 **108 Center Street-** consideration of a letter requesting mitigation approval and MOA participation
303 through the Section 106 process.

304

305 Brian Lever presents for Epsilon. Want to engage with the Commission on an MOA –
306 architectural Salvage and updated B Form for 108 Center St.

307

308 Deborah Morse – speaks about intentions of project, affordable housing for seniors.

309

310 Brian Lever – would like a letter supporting our mitigation package.

311

312 Elton Elperin – would like more info on tracking the salvaged items. Brookline should have a
313 street sign program to track and represent these lost buildings.

314

315 Jim Batchelor – can see reasons for demolition, but it is the last of its kind would like a sign.

316

317 Richard Panciera – would also like a sign. But this could lead to a lot of signs. The history
318 would benefit the neighborhood.

319

320 Alex Villanueva – agree. In DC the decommissioned fire phones had signs about history. Newton
321 electrical boxes have images of what Newton Corner use to look like.

322

323 David Jack – on Commonwealth Avenue, at the midrise at Brighton Marine, there are photos of
324 previous neighborhood.
325
326 Brian Lever – will ask about a panel in front of the building. The B form provides all the
327 information.
328
329 Elton Elperin – we ask for panel and tracking of salvaged materials.
330
331 Alex Villanueva & David King– agree the info panel is not too much to ask for.
332
333 Jim Batchelor – motion to ask that the mitigation include a panel marker. Elton Elperin will
334 write letter.
335
336 Elizabeth Armstrong – asks the applicant to provide an example letter.
337
338 Deborah M – agrees to provide.
339
340 Elizabeth Armstrong – will help with letter draft.
341
342 Elton Elperin – second motion.
343
344 David King – yes, Wendy Ecker – yes, David Jack – yes, Richard Panciera – yes, Jim Batchelor
345 – yes, Peter Kleiner – yes. Elton Elperin – yes
346
347
348 Waldo Durgan DAT
349 Elton Elperin on DAT
350
351
352
353 The meeting was adjourned.